

---

**From:** Keith Mason (STFC,CPC) [mailto:Keith.Mason@stfc.ac.uk]

**Sent:** Sun 1/27/2008 8:35 PM

**To:** Steve Miller; H.R.A.Jones@herts.ac.uk

**Cc:** Richard Wade (STFC,SPO); Gordon Ernest Bromage; Ade, Peter; Aylward, Alan; Bailey, Mark; Baldwin, John; Balikhin, M; Balogh, Andre; Barlow, Mike; Barrow, John; Barstow, Martin; Bate, Matthew; Bob Bingham (RAL,SPBU); Binns, Chris; Birkinshaw, K; Birkinshaw, Mark; Bode, Mike; Bonnell, Ian; Bower, R; Brinks, Ellias; Brown, John; Browne, Ian; Burchell, Mark; Burnell, Jocelyn; Cameron, Andrew; Cargill, Peter; Carr, Brian; Carswell, Bob; Carter, Dave; Chapman, Sandra; Charles, Phil; Cockell, Charles; Coe, Malcolm; Cole, Shaun; Coles, Peter; Collins, Chris; Copeland, Ed; Cowley, Stan; Crowther, Paul; Cruise, Mike; Culhane, Len; Davies, Rod; Davies, Roger; Dean, Tony; Dehnen, Walter; Diamond, Phil; Done, Chris; Dougherty, Michelle; Doyle, Gerry; Drew, Janet; Dufton, Philip; Malcolm Dunlop (RAL,SPBU); Dyson, John; Eales, Steve; Edmunds, Mike; Efstathiou, George; Elliott, David; Elsworth, Yvonne; Emerson, Jim; Evans, Nye; Fabian, Andy; Fender, Rob; Fitzsimmons, Alan; Fraser, George; Frenk, Carlos; Gear, Walter; Gibson, Bradley Kenneth; Gilmore, Gerry; Gough, Douglas; Grady, Monica; Grande, Manuel; Greaves, Neville; Griffin, Matt; Grishchuk, Leonid; Gull, Stephen; Haniff, Chris; Mike Hapgood (RAL,SPBU); Harra, Louise; Richard Harrison (RAL,SPBU); Hartquist, Tom; Hewish, Antony; Hills, Richard; Hood, Alan; Horne, Keith; Hough, J; Hough, Jim; Howarth, Ian; Hughes, David; John, Papaloizou; Jones, Barrie; Jones, Mike; Jordan, Carole; Keenan, Francis; Kennicut, Rob; King, Andrew; Knapen, Johan; Kurtz, Donald Wayne; Lahav, Ofer; Lasenby, Anthony; Lawrence, Andy; Lester, Mark; Liddle, Andrew; Lidsey, Jim; Mike Lockwood (RAL,SPBU); Longair, Malcolm; Lyne, Andrew; Maartens, Roy; Macdonald, Geoff; Marsh, Tom; Mason, Nigel; Mavron, V; McCaughrean, Mark; McHardy, Ian; Meikle, Peter; Merrifield, Michael; Millar, Tom; Miller, John; Miller, Steve; Mitchell, Nick; Morris, Simon; Mundell, Carole; Murdin, Paul; Murray, Carl; Nandra, Kirpal; Naylor, Tim; Nelson, Richard; Nichol, Robert; Pedlar, Alan; Pettini, Max; Phillipps, Stephen; Pillinger, Colin; Ponman, Trevor; Pounds, Ken; Priest, Eric; Pringle, Jim; Rawlings, Steve; Rees, Martin; Roberts, Bernard; Robertus; Robinson, Michael; Robinson, Terry; Ian Robson; Adrian Russell; Roxburgh, Ian; Ruderman, M S; Sarre, Peter; Sathyaprakash, B; Schutz, Bernard; Schwartz, Steve; Shanks, Tom; Silk, Joe; Simnett, George; Smail, Ian; Smartt, Stephen; Smith, Michael; Smith, Robert; Starkman, Glenn; Strain, K; Sumner, Timothy; Tadhunter, Clive; Tavakol, Reza; Tennyson, Jonathan; Thomas, Peter; Thompson, Michael; Walters, K; Wands, David; Ward, Martin; Warwick, Bob; Watson, Alan; Watson, Mike; White, Glenn; Whitworth, Anthony; Wilkinson, Peter; Williams, David; Williams, Iwan; Willis, Alan; Willmore, Peter; Withington, Stafford; Worrall, Diana; Wright, Ian; Zijlstra, Albert; bs1@phys.soton.ac.uk; J.C.Zarnecki; michael.kramer@manchester.ac.uk; Rob Ivison; s.g.ryan@herts.ac.uk; shude.mao@manchester.ac.uk

**Subject:** RE: Gemini announcement

Steve

I completely agree. We are pursuing it, and its important that the UK speaks with one voice

KOM

---

**From:** Steve Miller [mailto:ucapt0s@ucl.ac.uk]

**Sent:** Sun 27/01/2008 19:23

**To:** Keith Mason (STFC,CPC); H.R.A.Jones@herts.ac.uk

**Cc:** Richard Wade (STFC,SPO); Gordon Ernest Bromage; Ade, Peter; Aylward, Alan; Bailey, Mark; Baldwin, John; Balikhin, M; Balogh, Andre; Barlow, Mike; Barrow, John; Barstow, Martin; Bate, Matthew; Bob Bingham (RAL,SPBU); Binns, Chris; Birkinshaw, K; Birkinshaw, Mark; Bode, Mike; Bonnell, Ian; Bower, R; Brinks, Ellias; Brown, John; Browne, Ian; Burchell, Mark; Burnell, Jocelyn; Cameron, Andrew; Cargill, Peter; Carr, Brian; Carswell, Bob; Carter, Dave; Chapman, Sandra; Charles, Phil; Cockell, Charles; Coe, Malcolm; Cole, Shaun; Coles, Peter; Collins, Chris; Copeland, Ed; Cowley, Stan; Crowther, Paul; Cruise, Mike; Culhane, Len; Davies, Rod; Davies, Roger; Dean, Tony; Dehnen, Walter; Diamond, Phil; Done, Chris; Dougherty, Michelle; Doyle, Gerry; Drew, Janet; Dufton, Philip; Malcolm Dunlop (RAL,SPBU); Dyson, John; Eales, Steve; Edmunds, Mike; Efstathiou, George; Elliott, David; Elsworth, Yvonne; Emerson, Jim; Evans, Nye; Fabian, Andy; Fender, Rob; Fitzsimmons, Alan; Fraser, George; Frenk, Carlos; Gear, Walter; Gibson, Bradley Kenneth; Gilmore, Gerry; Gough, Douglas; Grady, Monica; Grande, Manuel; Greaves, Neville; Griffin, Matt; Grishchuk, Leonid; Gull, Stephen; Haniff, Chris; Mike Hapgood (RAL,SPBU); Harra, Louise; Richard Harrison (RAL,SPBU); Hartquist, Tom; Hewish, Antony; Hills, Richard; Hood, Alan; Horne, Keith; Hough, J; Hough, Jim; Howarth,

Ian; Hughes, David; John, Papaloizou; Jones, Barrie; Jones, Mike; Jordan, Carole; Keenan, Francis; Kennicut, Rob; King, Andrew; Knapen, Johan; Kurtz, Donald Wayne; Lahav, Ofer; Lasenby, Anthony; Lawrence, Andy; Lester, Mark; Liddle, Andrew; Lidsey, Jim; Mike Lockwood (RAL,SPBU); Longair, Malcolm; Lyne, Andrew; Maartens, Roy; Macdonald, Geoff; Marsh, Tom; Mason, Nigel; Mavron, V; McCaughrean, Mark; McHardy, Ian; Meikle, Peter; Merrifield, Michael; Millar, Tom; Miller, John; Miller, Steve; Mitchell, Nick; Morris, Simon; Mundell, Carole; Murdin, Paul; Murray, Carl; Nandra, Kirpal; Naylor, Tim; Nelson, Richard; Nichol, Robert; Pedlar, Alan; Pettini, Max; Phillipps, Stephen; Pillinger, Colin; Ponman, Trevor; Pounds, Ken; Priest, Eric; Pringle, Jim; Rawlings, Steve; Rees, Martin; Roberts, Bernard; Robertus; Robinson, Michael; Robinson, Terry; Ian Robson (ROE,UKATC); Roe, Andrew; Roxburgh, Ian; Ruderman, M S; Sarre, Peter; Sathyaprakash, B; Schutz, Bernard; Schwartz, Steve; Shanks, Tom; Silk, Joe; Simnett, George; Smail, Ian; Smartt, Stephen; Smith, Michael; Smith, Robert; Starkman, Glenn; Strain, K; Sumner, Timothy; Tadhunter, Clive; Tavakol, Reza; Tennyson, Jonathan; Thomas, Peter; Thompson, Michael; Walters, K; Wands, David; Ward, Martin; Warwick, Bob; Watson, Alan; Watson, Mike; White, Glenn; Whitworth, Anthony; Wilkinson, Peter; Williams, David; Williams, Iwan; Willis, Alan; Willmore, Peter; Withington, Stafford; Worrall, Diana; Wright, Ian; Zijlstra, Albert; bs1@phys.soton.ac.uk; J.C.Zarnecki; michael.kramer@manchester.ac.uk; Rob Ivison (ROE,UKATC); s.g.ryan@herts.ac.uk; shude.mao@manchester.ac.uk

**Subject:** RE: Gemini announcement

Dear Keith and Richard,

I am clearly being very stupid, but this seems to have something of the Marx Brothers' "Party of the Third Party" sketch about it.

How can a Board of which the UK are members exclude the UK from attending the said Board and then, in our absence, declare that UK are no longer members of the Board?

Either

1) we were members of the Board before the Board's declaration that we are not members of the Board - in which case we had a right to be there to put our case for a change in our relationship to Gemini, whilst still remaining members of the Board

or

2) we had ourselves already withdrawn from the Board prior to the closed meeting - in which case the Board did not declare we are not members of the Board because we had already declared it.

If interpretation 1) is that case - and if I understand Richard's email correctly - that's how I read it, we surely have some legal/diplomatic redress. In which case, surely we should pursue it.

Best wishes,

Steve

At 14:36 27/01/2008, Keith Mason (STFC,CPC) wrote:

>Dear Hugh

>

>I am very disappointed by the reaction of the Gemini Board. Our  
>objective in STFC is to retain access to Gemini-N for the UK, and we  
>put what I thought was a very constructive proposal to them which  
>would have benefitted both the partnership and the individual  
>members. This was rejected by a closed session of the Board from  
>which we were excluded, with no chance to put the case, or enter in  
>to any type of negotiation. This precipitate action by the Board is  
>in marked contrast to the UK's attitude when the partnership was in

>trouble recently over the Aspen programme, and the UK put money up  
>front to allow the programme to continue and cover shortfalls on the  
>US/Canadian side. I would have thought that the UK's past  
>substantial commitment and support for the Gemini project would have  
>deserved a more measured hearing worthy of a fine international partnership.

>  
>Best wishes

>Keith

>-----

>From: Hugh Jones [<mailto:H.R.A.Jones@herts.ac.uk>]

>Sent: Sat 26/01/2008 00:54

>To: Keith Mason (STFC,CPC)

>Cc: Richard Wade (STFC,SPO); Gordon Ernest Bromage; Ade, Peter;  
>Aylward, Alan; Bailey, Mark; Baldwin, John; Balikhin, M; Balogh,  
>Andre; Barlow, Mike; Barrow, John; Barstow, Martin; Bate, Matthew;  
>Bob Bingham (RAL,SPBU); Binns, Chris; Birkinshaw, K; Birkinshaw,  
>Mark; Bode, Mike; Bonnell, Ian; Bower, R; Brinks, Ellias; Brown,  
>John; Browne, Ian; Burchell, Mark; Burnell, Jocelyn; Cameron,  
>Andrew; Cargill, Peter; Carr, Brian; Carswell, Bob; Carter, Dave;  
>Chapman, Sandra; Charles, Phil; Cockell, Charles; Coe, Malcolm;  
>Cole, Shaun; Coles, Peter; Collins, Chris; Copeland, Ed; Cowley,  
>Stan; Crowther, Paul; Cruise, Mike; Culhane, Len; Davies, Rod;  
>Davies, Roger; Dean, Tony; Dehnen, Walter; Diamond, Phil; Done,  
>Chris; Dougherty, Michelle; Doyle, Gerry; Drew, Janet; Dufton,  
>Philip; Malcolm Dunlop (RAL,SPBU); Dyson, John; Eales, Steve;  
>Edmunds, Mike; Efstathiou, George; Elliott, David; Elsworth, Yvonne;  
>Emerson, Jim; Evans, Nye; Fabian, Andy; Fender, Rob; Fitzsimmons,  
>Alan; Fraser, George; Frenk, Carlos; Gear, Walter; Gibson, Bradley  
>Kenneth; Gilmore, Gerry; Gough, Douglas; Grady, Monica; Grande,  
>Manuel; Greaves, Neville; Griffin, Matt; Grishchuk, Leonid; Gull,  
>Stephen; Haniff, Chris; Mike Hapgood (RAL,SPBU); Harra, Louise;  
>Richard Harrison (RAL,SPBU); Hartquist, Tom; Hewish, Antony; Hills,  
>Richard; Hood, Alan; Horne, Keith; Hough, J; Hough, Jim; Howarth,  
>Ian; Hughes, David; John, Papaloizou; Jones, Barrie; Jones, Mike;  
>Jordan, Carole; Keenan, Francis; Kennicut, Rob; King, Andrew;  
>Knapen, Johan; Kurtz, Donald Wayne; Lahav, Ofer; Lasenby, Anthony;  
>Lawrence, Andy; Lester, Mark; Liddle, Andrew; Lidsey, Jim; Mike  
>Lockwood (RAL,SPBU); Longair, Malcolm; Lyne, Andrew; Maartens, Roy;  
>Macdonald, Geoff; Marsh, Tom; Mason, Nigel; Mavron, V; McCaughrean,  
>Mark; McHardy, Ian; Meikle, Peter; Merrifield, Michael; Millar, Tom;  
>Miller, John; Miller, Steve; Mitchell, Nick; Morris, Simon; Mundell,  
>Carole; Murdin, Paul; Murray, Carl; Nandra, Kirpal; Naylor, Tim;  
>Nelson, Richard; Nichol, Robert; Pedlar, Alan; Pettini, Max;  
>Phillipps, Stephen; Pillinger, Colin; Ponman, Trevor; Pounds, Ken;  
>Priest, Eric; Pringle, Jim; Rawlings, Steve; Rees, Martin; Roberts,  
>Bernard; Robertus; Robinson, Michael; Robinson, Terry; Ian Robson  
>(ROE,UKATC); Roe, Andrew; Roxburgh, Ian; Ruderman, M S; Sarre,  
>Peter; Sathyaprakash, B; Schutz, Bernard; Schwartz, Steve; Shanks,  
>Tom; Silk, Joe; Simnett, George; Smail, Ian; Smartt, Stephen; Smith,  
>Michael; Smith, Robert; Starkman, Glenn; Strain, K; Sumner, Timothy;  
>Tadhunter, Clive; Tavakol, Reza; Tennyson, Jonathan; Thomas, Peter;  
>Thompson, Michael; Walters, K; Wands, David; Ward, Martin; Warwick,  
>Bob; Watson, Alan; Watson, Mike; White, Glenn; Whitworth, Anthony;  
>Wilkinson, Peter; Williams, David; Williams, Iwan; Willis, Alan;  
>Willmore, Peter; Withington, Stafford; Worrall, Diana; Wright, Ian;  
>Zijlstra, Albert; [bsl@phys.soton.ac.uk](mailto:bsl@phys.soton.ac.uk); J.C.Zarnecki;  
>[michael.kramer@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:michael.kramer@manchester.ac.uk); Rob Ivison (ROE,UKATC);  
>[s.g.ryan@herts.ac.uk](mailto:s.g.ryan@herts.ac.uk); [shude.mao@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:shude.mao@manchester.ac.uk)  
>Subject: Gemini announcement

>

>Keith/Richard

>

>I see the STFC announcement about Gemini but do not understand

>why it makes financial (or scientific) sense to get out of Gemini

>now rather than in 2012?

><[http://www.scitech.ac.uk/PMC/PReI/STFC/Gemini-](http://www.scitech.ac.uk/PMC/PReI/STFC/Gemini-Update.aspx)

[Update.aspx](http://www.scitech.ac.uk/PMC/PReI/STFC/Gemini-Update.aspx)><http://www.scitech.ac.uk/PMC/PReI/STFC/Gemini-Update.aspx>

>

>1. By getting out of Gemini now STFC gain 24-7=17 million

>

>2. By getting out of Gemini in 2012 (or later) STFC

>(i) CAN REALISE THE 35+ MILLION INVESTMENT IN THE CAPITAL PHASE which

>is plausible given how well Gemini works and the very broad and varied

>interest in taking over the UK share (demonstrated by the Gemini Board's

>reaction to the STFC proposal)

>

>and also

>(ii) gain instrument contracts for instruments to do the HIGHEST PRIORITY

>astrophysics: WFMOS and PRVS, neither of which is covered by ESO

>membership. PRVS was already in the bag for the ATC as the major

>contractor. Whichever way WFMOS worked out I thought the UK was going to

>get more than juste retour from the instrument build and the potential for

>the lion's share of the science action.

>(iii) have five years of highly oversubscribed 8m time with clear cut

>functionality/sky not enabled by ESO membership (with continuing sales

>occurring to recoup substantial monies from Gemini-S)

>(iv) avoid scuppering trust in future STFC international agreements

>

>Hugh